

may occasionally cause readers to find themselves lost among the trees of the proverbial forest, but in the end, they will not only better understand religion's role in the Civil War, but also more fully appreciate the complexities of history, especially at moments when personal and public faith and prolonged war intersect.

CHRISTOPHER C. JONES, PH.D. CANDIDATE
The College of William and Mary

Benjamin L. Hartley. *Evangelicals at a Crossroads: Revivalism and Social Reform in Boston, 1860-1910*. Durham: U New Hampshire P, 2011. 288 pp. \$39.95.

Using city-wide revivals—that of Dwight L. Moody in 1877 and those of Gipsy Smith in 1909 and Wilbur L. Chapman in 1910—as “book-end” events, Benjamin L. Hartley describes the previously underexplored history of “upstart (and often contentious) evangelicals” in post-Civil War Boston and their influence on religious life as well as political life and social reform efforts.

Focusing primarily on the involvement of Methodists, Baptists and Salvationists (the Salvation Army) in the holiness movement, Hartley “emphasizes the revivalistic manifestation of evangelical piety . . . and the roots of their social reform efforts . . .” (13-14). He also looks at the “anti-Catholic and labor organizing of Boston evangelicals . . . as Irish and Boston Brahmins vied for control of city hall and the statehouse”; the role of women as leaders in these efforts (including the interrelatedness of the temperance movement and the women’s foreign mission movement and the invasion of the Salvation Army, led mostly by women); and the leadership role of American-born immigrants.

Hartley further examines many of the “crossroads” faced by these “upstart evangelicals” as he analyzes the conflicts that they experienced as they dealt with “[n]ew intellectual developments in biblical scholarship, differing attitudes toward world religions, and differences in the priority placed on evangelistic efforts and social reform” [which] caused sharp—and sometimes highly nuanced—disagreements among evangelical leaders” (14).

Using Boston’s North End as a case study, Hartley looks at the changes in evangelical ministries over the period in question including the neighborhood’s transition from one of primarily Irish immigrants to one in which Italians and Jews were dominant, as well as the change in leadership from American born immigrants to foreign born immigrants, especially Italians.

Hartley concludes with the change in direction which evangelicals took after the turn of the century which led, in part, to a more secularized view of social reform and social gospel efforts for some and a focus on fundamentalism for others.

Hartley’s book additionally provides a welcome addition to the previously unexplored role of New England Methodists in the holiness movement and their strong anti-Catholic stance at the end of the nineteenth century, as

well as an expansion of the social reform efforts of such persons as Henry Helms, Eben Tourjee, Amanda Clark and others, including the role of both students and professors at Boston University School of Theology.

Evangelicals at the Crossroads is well-researched and well-documented yet is written in language than can easily be grasped by all readers. It is an important book both for those interested in the history of evangelicals as well as those interested in New England Methodism.

THE REV. PATRICIA J. THOMPSON, HISTORIAN
New England Annual Conference

Diane Leclerc. *Discovering Christian Holiness: The Heart of Wesleyan-Holiness Theology*. Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press of Kansas City, 2010. 320 pp. \$39.99.

Recent years have seen a growing number of books that attempt to introduce or make summary statements of theology from a Wesleyan perspective. Joining that growing introductory literature in Wesleyan theology is Diane Leclerc's *Discovering Christian Holiness: The Heart of Wesleyan-Holiness Theology*. Leclerc, professor of theology at Northwest Nazarene University and past president of the Wesleyan Theological Society, emphasizes holiness as the core thread of Wesleyan theology, or rather takes Wesleyan theology to be part of a wider holiness theology running from scripture through the history of the Christian church to the present day.

Unlike many other similar introductions, Leclerc did not organize the book by the traditional loci of theology (e.g., God, Christ, Eschatology) or by the thematic emphases of John Wesley's thought, but instead organized her insights into four parts corresponding to the Wesleyan quadrilateral. Part 1, "Biblical Holiness," has two chapters, "How to Read the Bible as a Wesleyan" and "The Whole Holy Tenor of Scripture." Part 2, "Holiness History," has two chapters, "Holiness in History: Late Antiquity to 1700" and "Holiness in History: 1703-2000." Part 3, "Holiness Theology for Today," has three chapters, "The Holy God," "Created and Fallen Humanity," and "Full Salvation." Part 4, "Holy Living for a New Century" has five chapters. As the organization suggests, scripture and Christian history provide an initial one third to two fifths of the book, roughly equal to the focus Leclerc provides in the fourth unit on "Holy Living for a New Century." This final part utilizes five "paradigms" each receiving full chapters. The chapters are "Holiness as Purity," "Holiness as Perfection," "Holiness as Power," "Holiness as Character," and the final chapter of the book, "Holiness as Love." These chapters are uniformly well done, insightful, and, in a word, wise. One might have anticipated a chapter on "Holiness as Hope," but as is, this is the strongest section of the book.

As for its use as a classroom text, *Discovering Christian Holiness* includes a number of helpful features such as an excellent glossary, key words, summary statements, questions for reflection, and suggestions for further reading. It has no index, though Leclerc frequently utilizes end notes for more extended scholarly discussion of particular points. Several of the chapters might

H-Net Reviews

in the Humanities & Social Sciences

Benjamin L. Hartley. *Evangelicals at a Crossroads: Revivalism and Social Reform in Boston, 1860-1910*. Durham: University of New Hampshire Press, 2011. xi + 288 pp. \$85.00 (cloth), ISBN 978-1-58465-928-0; \$39.95 (paper), ISBN 978-1-58465-929-7.

Reviewed by James Ivy (Trinity University)
Published on H-SHGAPE (October, 2011)
Commissioned by Julia Irwin

The Other Boston Protestants

Benjamin Hartley's *Evangelicals at a Crossroads* is an important contribution to the history of religion and social reform in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Boston. Readers familiar with the literature on settlement houses, the story of the displacement of Brahmins by Irish Catholics, or the history of the modernist-fundamentalist controversies will find themselves in new territory, and this alone would make this a significant book. Opening the first chapter with Dwight L. Moody's spectacular 1877 revival, Hartley weaves a complex narrative of the individuals and institutions that transformed the social and religious landscape to a degree often overlooked today.

The evangelicals of Hartley's title are more specifically those evangelicals who contributed to or emerged from the holiness movement of the nineteenth century. Methodists, conservative Episcopalians, and the leadership of the Salvation Army in Boston are at the center of this narrative. Methodists in particular, like the popular preacher Henry Morgan and the founders of Boston University, rose to prominence in the city at a time when they were seen by their critics and supporters alike as less educated and less privileged than the Congregationalists and Unitarians who had dominated the religious culture of the city. Establishing churches and missions among the immigrants of Boston's North End, these Methodists exemplified the dynamic tension of nineteenth-century evangelicalism, a Christianity that worked to reform society while maintaining the preeminence of personal salvation in their theology.

As a result of their social status and egalitarian theology, the Methodists in the nineteenth century were often more sympathetic to the plight of working-class Bostonians than were many other Protestants.

Nevertheless, they were more likely to express a virulent anti-Catholicism. Hartley traces this to their rural origins and migration to a Boston culture whose Brahmin leaders already were developing uneasy alliances with an ascending Catholic power. Controversies over the election of members to the Public School Committee in the 1880s focused the city's attention on religious animosities, but Methodists like Henry Morgan already were attacking the Catholic hierarchy with lurid accusations of rape and drug abuse. However, these attacks were not usually directed at the Catholic laity. Evangelicals worked hard to provide social services for Catholic immigrants, even as they assailed the clergy and tried to convert the parishioners.

The activities of women are at the center of Hartley's analysis. The egalitarian theology of Methodism and the holiness focus on personal piety provided evangelical women a platform unavailable to them in other institutions. Mary Livermore and Frances Willard were accepted in the pulpit. The women of the Methodists' Deaconess Home and Training School and the women of the Salvation Army worked alongside male colleagues throughout the city.

The theological disputes of the era regarding modernist theology or the social gospel that so sharply divided many denominations did not draw such clear lines among Hartley's subjects. He contrasts the premillennialism of A. J. Gordon's Evangelistic Association of New England with the social gospel focus of Edgar Helms and the Morgan Memorial Church, and finds institutions moving in different directions rather than engaging in conflict. Boston's Methodists were more concerned with doing the work of reform or evangelism than with purging their denomination of perceived heresies.

In a chapter on Boston's North and South Ends, Hartley highlights the tensions that these competing strains of evangelism and reform created in a city that was becoming increasingly immigrant and Catholic. Methodists, including those affiliated with Boston University, established settlement houses in the heart of immigrant neighborhoods. The University Settlement House was established in the Italian North End, and was soon followed by a new church. Much of the Methodist success in the North End was the result of the work of a dynamic Italian immigrant convert, Gaetano Conte, whose background made him no more sympathetic to the Catholic Church than were the rural, native Methodists.

Hartley concludes with two twentieth-century revivals, bookends to Moody's great revival that introduced the book. Gipsy Smith led a successful revival in 1906 at the Baptist Tremont Temple, with a reported 2,500 converts. In 1909 a coalition of evangelical leaders organized a citywide campaign with si-

multaneous meetings at a variety of churches. Both of these events received favorable press, but neither had the impact in the city that Moody's revival had. The upstart evangelicals were no longer outsiders to the region's Protestant establishment. Nevertheless, the later revivals and their aftermath demonstrated the persistence and the variety of evangelical influence in Boston, and the nimbleness with which Methodists in particular adapted to a changing city.

Hartley's focus on the evangelicals of the holiness tradition allows him to delve into distinctions and alliances that were important to his subjects, but it also excludes the Congregationalist, Presbyterian, and Baptist reformers, who despite their Calvinist roots were solidly evangelical long before the twentieth century. Even so, *Evangelicals at a Crossroads* is a useful and corrective addition to the rich literature on the most chronicled city in American religious history.

If there is additional discussion of this review, you may access it through the list discussion logs at:
<http://h-net.msu.edu/cgi-bin/logbrowse.pl>.

Citation: James Ivy. Review of Hartley, Benjamin L., *Evangelicals at a Crossroads: Revivalism and Social Reform in Boston, 1860-1910*. H-SHGAPE, H-Net Reviews. October, 2011.

URL: <http://www.h-net.org/reviews/showrev.php?id=33111>



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 United States License.

CHOICE

CURRENT REVIEWS FOR ACADEMIC LIBRARIES

A publication of the Association of College and Research Libraries
A division of the American Library Association
Editorial Offices: 575 Main Street, Suite 300, Middletown, CT 06457-3445
Phone: (860) 347-6933 Fax: (860) 704-0465
www.choicemag.org

August 2011 Vol. 48 No. 11

HUMANITIES

Religion

Barbara Briggs Publicist
University Press of New England
One Court St
Suite 250
Lebanon, NH 03766

The following review appeared in the August 2011 issue of CHOICE:

48-6841 BV3775 2010-31299 CIP
Hartley, Benjamin L. **Evangelicals at a crossroads: revivalism & social reform in Boston, 1860-1910.** University of New Hampshire/University Press of New England, 2011. 288p bibl index afp ISBN 9781584659280, \$85.00; ISBN 9781584659297 pbk, \$39.95

In this magnificently researched study of evangelical Christianity in late-19th-century Boston, Hartley (Palmer Theological Seminary) analyzes the complex interaction between faith and culture in a rapidly changing urban landscape. For Hartley, all history is essentially local; consequently, by examining patterns in a specific location he can more effectively illustrate the national religious currents of this era. Thus the book demonstrates that interactions between revivalism and social reform were far more complex than commonly portrayed. In fact, the author points out that revivalism and social reform experienced coupling and decoupling within religious leaders in varied mixtures as those leaders interacted with Boston's political, economic, and demographic climate. Hartley argues convincingly that the holiness movement shaped the spirituality of a broad array of leading figures--not only among Methodists, but also among Episcopalians, Baptists, and even Unitarians, even as its strength waned by the beginning of the 20th century. **Summing Up:** Highly recommended. Libraries with strong theological collections; upper-division undergraduates through researchers/faculty. -- *B. W. Hamilton, Northeastern Seminary*